

National Advisory Committee on the Sex Trafficking of Children and Youth in the United States Summary of Meeting October 4, 2019

Friday, October 4, 2019 | 9:30 a.m.-5 p.m.

The National Advisory Committee on the Sex Trafficking of Children and Youth in the United States (the Committee) convened virtually for its fifth meeting on October 4, 2019, at headquarters of the National Center for Missing & Exploited Children (NCMEC). The National Human Trafficking Training and Technical Assistance Center (NHTTAC) and NCMEC ensured there were no technical difficulties and advised public participants observing the meeting through Adobe Connect about technical support. Committee Chair Glen (J.R.) Ujifusa, Senior Deputy District Attorney of Multnomah County, Oregon, opened the meeting, held a roll call, and established that a quorum was met.

Committee Members

Present Virtually

Rebecca Bender, Rebecca Bender Initiative Robert Lung, 18th Judicial District, Arapahoe County and Douglas County Justice Centers, Colorado Camille Naaktgeboren, Ph.D. University of Nevada, Las Vegas

Present in Person

Justice Bobbe Bridge (Ret.), Center for Children & Youth Justice

Marissa Castellanos, Catholic Charities of Louisville

Kimberly Chang, M.D., M.P.H., Asian Health Services

Governor Doug Ducey (Substitute: Gil Orrantia), Arizona

Captain Pi Downsbrough, Massachusetts State Police

Jordan Greenbaum, M.D., International Centre for Missing and Exploited Children

Stacey Katz, Psy.D., WestCoast Children's Clinic

Christine Raino, Esq., Shared Hope International

Judge John J. Romero, Jr., Second Judicial District Court, Albuquerque, New Mexico, Children's Court Division

Kathy Sauve, Lutheran Social Services of Minnesota-Brainerd

Staca Shehan, National Center for Missing & Exploited Children

Glen (J.R.) Ujifusa, Jr., Senior Deputy District Attorney of Multnomah County, Oregon (Committee Chair)

Yasmin Vafa, Rights4Girls

Erin Williamson, L.C.S.W., M.P.A., Love146

Not Present

John Vanek, San Jose Police Department (Ret.)

Other Attendees

Lists based on registration; attendance not taken at meeting.

Federal Participants

Katherine Chon, Director, Office on Trafficking in Persons, Administration for Children and Families, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services (Committee Designated Federal Officer)

Kimberly Casey, Office on Trafficking in Persons

Kate Cooper, Office on Trafficking in Persons

Khaila Montgomery, Office on Trafficking in Persons

Jaqueline O'Reilly, Office of Juvenile Justice and Delinquency Prevention, U.S. Department of Justice

Public Participants

Margaret Blankemeyer, National Human Trafficking Training and Technical Assistance Center Ava Donald, National Human Trafficking Training and Technical Assistance Center Jodie Langs, WestCoast Children's Clinic Annabelle Thomson, National Human Trafficking Training and Technical Assistance Center Stephanie Vega, National Human Trafficking Training and Technical Assistance Center

Opening Remarks

Committee Designated Federal Officer Katherine Chon welcomed everyone to the fifth meeting.

Welcome and Committee Business

Committee Chair J.R. Ujifusa welcomed Committee members and reviewed the agenda for the meeting. The Committee's preliminary outline of recommendations were submitted to Congress in January 2019, and the Committee is now finalizing definitions and recommendations for the final report, which is due to Congress January 18, 2020. Mr. Ujifusa and Ms. Chon discussed the Committee's responsibility to use the recommendations to evaluate the states on their responses and resources for children and youth victims of sex trafficking. Mr. Ujifusa explained that after approval of the Committee's recommendations is received, NHTTAC will copy edit and format the report, including the recommendations, definitions, and federal statutes, which will then undergo a final review by the Committee Chair and Designated Federal Officer. Mr. Ujifusa reminded the Committee that the priority for the meeting was to finalize each of the recommendations.

Old Business

Data Collection Efforts

As part of the federal statute creating the National Advisory Committee, the Committee members must categorize the individual recommendations as either a Tier 1 or Tier 2 recommendation, which will be determined by the state's ability to meet the Committee's recommendations. The Committee previously decided that it would create a survey as the evaluation tool and that trafficking data specific to children and youth would be collected. Khaila Montgomery of the Office on Trafficking in Persons (OTIP) explained the process of creating and disseminating a survey or tiering tool to the public. After the Committee reaches an agreement on the tool used to evaluate and sort the recommendations into tiers, a federal notice will be submitted to the Immediate Office of the Assistant Secretary, Administration for Children and Families. The public has 60 days from the federal notice date to review and provide comments on the Committee's evaluation tool and process. After the 60-day period, the Committee will review and respond to the public's comments and then resubmit the tool to the Federal Register, and the public will have an additional 30 days to review the updated tool. After the Committee reviews the second round of public comments and reaches an agreement, the tool is submitted to the Office of Management and Budget. The entire process typically takes 6–9 months before the tool may be sent to the states and data collection may start. Ms. Chon advised the Committee that April 2020 will be the earliest date to share the OMB-approved evaluation tool with the states. Committee members Dr. Jordan Greenbaum, Marissa Castellanos, Christine Raino, and Mr. Ujifusa volunteered to work together with OTIP on the development of the evaluation tool.

Tiering Process

The Committee discussed the process of disseminating the survey and tiered recommendations to the states and how this data will be collected. Ms. Chon clarified that the states would self-identify their responses to each recommendation as Tier 1 or Tier 2 based on the Committee's definitions and share information to support their claim. The Committee discussed the idea that the National Governors Association could disseminate the survey to the Governor for each state. A

point of contact from the Governor's office will bring any questions or concerns from the states to the Committee about statistics and information they share for the tiering process. Kathy Sauve of Lutheran Social Services of Minnesota—Brainerd said the Committee would need to explore and identify ways to engage tribes to report on the evaluation tool. The Committee agreed to provide states and tribes with 6 months' notice before providing the evaluation tool and the expectation of sharing data. The Committee also agreed to include language in the dissemination that allows states and tribes to know this is a tool to expand best practices and establish a baseline and will not be used to penalize states who do not meet all the Committee's recommendations.

Request to Congress

The Committee discussed the letter they sent to Congress requesting that the start date for the Committee reflect when the Committee first met, rather than when it was formed. The extension would allow the Committee to continue working on state results, evaluations, and recommendations until the interim report in 2021, with the final delivery of the report on state implementation of tiered recommendations due January 2022. The Committee has not received a response to this request as of October 4, 2019.

Committee Working Session

Report to Congress

The Committee discussed the introduction of the report to ensure it captures a focus on trauma-informed care, impact of vicarious trauma, the survivor perspective, and the history of the anti-trafficking field. Previously, Ms. Bender of the Rebecca Bender Initiative and Ms. Smolenski (now retired) were nominated by the committee to provide input into the introduction on survivor-informed practices and the history of the field. The Committee agreed with Ms. Chon's recommendation to add an overview of state and federal legislation throughout the history. The introduction will also include other contextual information including notes on the age of children and youth, the non-exhaustive list of resources, and the intersectionality of the recommendations. The Committee also agreed to provide a final review of the introduction before the Chair's review on October 18, 2019. Committee members Rebecca Bender, Captain Pi Downsbrough, and Erin Williamson agreed to continue to work together on finalizing the introduction.

Tier 1 and 2 Evaluations

The Committee also continued discussions about Tier 1 and 2 assessments of each recommendation. Initially, the Committee discussed the possibility of using '25 percent of the population trained' and '75 percent of the population trained of the individual states' as measuring points for Tier 1 and Tier 2. Mr. Orrantia expressed concern about state evaluation based on percentage due to the wide variety in population between states and local counties. Multiple members of the Committee expressed concern that the current language in the report recommendations is nebulous and therefore not quantifiable. The Committee agreed that the percentage-based tiering does not work for all sections of the report (e.g., legislation) and will continue to work on the tiering process for the legal section. The Committee clarified that the survey would not be used as a comparison between states. The Committee continued to discuss how the tiers require accountability and should not be set too low but also allow for incorporation of quantitative data.

Public Dissemination of State Responses

The Committee discussed how and with whom the data and statistics collected from the states would be shared. Ms. Chon reminded the Committee of the statutory mandate to share its findings with federal and state partners. The Committee agreed to share the report with the National Governors Association, HHS's 10 regional offices, the U.S. Department of Justice, and the National Association of Attorneys General, the U.S. Conference of Mayors, International Association of Chiefs of Police, tribal entities, and other key stakeholders. Each Committee member will also share the report with their individual networks. There was discussion on whether it would be helpful for states to receive training and technical assistance on the report and survey and whether the Committee could share state points of contact with all states once available. The Committee's work is public information and will be shared on the Committee's webpage.

Current Topics in the Field

The Committee discussed current topics of focus in the field, such as cybercrimes and how to evaluate states' responses to online trafficking crimes, as well as decriminalization of prostitution and how this may affect the Committee's recommendations involving children and youth. Mr. Ujifusa and Ms. Williamson of Love 146 brought the focus to how recommendations must be applied to the entire anti-trafficking field, rather than fitting one side of a divided issue.

Public Comments

No public comments were received during the meeting. Kate Cooper of OTIP will track any public comments received following the adjournment of the public meeting.

Next Steps

The next National Advisory Committee meeting will be a virtual meeting on April 23, 2020. The subcommittees will hold meetings between now and the sixth public meeting. The next meetings will take place on September 16 and 17, 2020 and/or December 9 and 10, 2020; the former will be a virtual meeting and the latter will be an in-person meeting in Washington, DC.

Committee members will continue to work on the introduction of the report and add terms to the glossary until October 18, 2019, when the Chair is scheduled to review the report.

Adjournment

The meeting adjourned at 2:50 p.m. (eastern).