



Building Pathways to a Brighter Future



Measurement Matters

2014 HPOG Winter Grantee Meeting

Omni Shoreham Hotel
Washington, DC
Tuesday, December 2nd, 2014
2:15PM-3:15PM



Measurement Matters

“Measure and evaluate employment and earning outcomes. Knowing the results of individual job-driven training programs - how many people are hired and stay employed, and how much they earn – is essential both for job seekers to choose training wisely and for programs to continuously improve results. Agencies should measure outcomes, disaggregate the data to be sure all participants are well served, evaluate programs, and inform participants and employers of the results.”

*“Ready to Work: Job-Driven Training and American Opportunit.,” The White House. (July 2014)
http://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/default/files/docs/skills_report.pdf*

Purpose of the Session

- The purpose of the Measurement Matters session is to support grantees in effective and communicative measurement by focusing on...
 - Use of PRS data for stakeholder engagement;
 - and*
 - Application of sector-based approaches to cost-benefit analyses.

Overview of the Agenda

- Today's session will incorporate:
 - Use of PRS data to engage partners and plan for sustainability;
 - Exploration of sector-based approaches to cost-benefit analysis; and
 - Strategies for communicating data to various audiences.

Overview of the Agenda

- Our presenters:
 - Delores Graves, Project Director, Milwaukee Workforce Investment Board CareerWorks;
 - Tiziana Rota, Project Director, Schenectady Community College HPOG; and
 - Nathan Sick, Research Associate, The Urban Institute



Milwaukee Workforce Investment Board CareerWorks

Using Data to Engage Employers and Drive Sustainability

Delores Graves

Project Director

Milwaukee Workforce Investment Board CareerWorks

SOME KEY FACTS ABOUT MAWIB

- **Employer-driven** organization committed to creating a thriving economy by ensuring our workforce has the skills that match employer needs in jobs that lead to self sufficiency.
- Our workforce development services **overlap three workforce areas** in a seven county region that serves key healthcare employers who operate systems through this region.
- The role of MAWIB is that of a **coordinating, planning and collaborating** entity that develops and implements initiatives that result in a workforce system that is flexible, seamless and responsive to the dual needs of

Milwaukee Workforce Investment Board CareerWorks

Our **strategies** have been developed with the cooperation of a variety of stakeholders, partners and contracted providers.

To achieve our HPOG Program goals, it was imperative that we identify and fully engage with committed employer partners, assign and charge our contracted partners with measurable goals, administer effective contract monitoring , develop and regularly assess our strategies.

These efforts require **“a lot of collaboration.”**

Milwaukee Workforce Investment Board CareerWorks

Participant **employment** in the healthcare industry is the ultimate goal of the HPOG Program.

After missing our employment targets the first three years, we asked our employer partners the following key questions:

- Are we meeting the workforce demands of hiring employers?
- How can we connect to employers who have the demands?
- Have we identified effective outreach strategies needed and should we establish priorities for those efforts?
- How can we measure the effectiveness of those efforts?
- How can we insure the strategies and efforts will be implemented equally and consistently throughout our region?

Milwaukee Workforce Investment Board CareerWorks

A NEW STRATEGY WITH SPECIFIC OUTCOMES

- We contracted services of a partner to assume responsibilities for employer and outreach and job development activities for the three workforce board areas in our region.
- We established **specific measurable goals** targeted to ensure our program sites would meet participant placement goals.
- We identified a relevant and information specific employer activities and outcomes reporting system to measure performance, created an informational and **“easy to read”** format and reviewed the activities and the outcomes with the Employer Advisory Group.

Specific Goals to Measure Performance and Project Outcomes for Milwaukee AHEC Year 5 (September 30, 2014 – September 29, 2015)

Project Output Activities A – Job Development		Total GOALS	Milwaukee HTI	WOW	SE	ACTUAL Totals	Milwaukee HTI	WOW	SE
1.	Employment Activities Planned, Coordinated and Implementation								
	HPOG Site Area Job Fairs	7	3	2	2				
	On-Site Employer Interviews	18	12	3	3				
	Other	5	3	1	1				
1.	Job Search/Placement Assistance Services								
	# of Participants Receiving Job Announcements	500	280	120	100				
	# of Participants Receiving Individual Job Search Assistance (Pre-employment, Application Process)	350	220	70	60				
1.	Job Retention/Advancement Assistance Services								
	# of Participant Individual one-on-one Sessions	300	150	50	50				
	# of Group Sessions	12	5	4	3				
*ALL ACTIVITIES AND DETAILS ARE TO BE RECORDED IN EFFORT-TO-OUTCOME (ETO) REPORTING SYSTEM									
Project Output Activities B - Employer Engagement		Total GOALS	Milwaukee HTI	WOW	SE	ACTUAL Totals	Milwaukee HTI	WOW	SE
1.	Outreach Activities/Events Coordinated for Current Employer Partners	30	15	10	5				
1.	Outreach Activities/Events Coordinated to acquire New Employer Partners	30	15	10	5				
1.	# of New Employer Partners (First Time) who Employer HPOG Participants	10	5	3	2				
1.	# of Current Employer Partners who Expand Partnership with new/increased activities, i.e. on-site recruitments	10	5	3	2				

Milwaukee Workforce Investment Board CareerWorks

Project Outcomes Activities A – Participant Employment Assistance	Total Goals	Milwaukee HTI	WOW	SE	ACTUAL Totals	Milwaukee HTI	WOW	SE
1. New Hires in Healthcare Occupations	320	200	100	80				
Entry Level: Certified Nursing Assistant, Community Health Worker, Phlebotomist, Other Healthcare Support Workers	120	120	40	40				
Mid-Level: Certified Medical Assistant (MA), Pharmacy Technician (PT), Dental Assistant, Medical Records and Health Information Technician, Cardiovascular Technologist/Technician, Other Technicians (Renal Dialysis, Optician Technician)	100	40	30	20				
High Level: Registered Nurse, Respiratory Therapy Technician, Physical Therapy Assistants, Medical and Health Services Managers (IT)	100	40	30	20				
Other Healthcare Workers	20	10	5	5				
2. New Hires in other Non-Healthcare Occupations	30	15	10	5				
3. Success Story Submission	4							

***ALL ACTIVITIES AND DETAILS ARE TO BE RECORDED IN EFFORT-TO-OUTCOME (ETO) REPORTING SYSTEM**

Quarterly Reports on these Performance Measures are required and due within 30 days of each quarter end:

Quarter End – December 30, 2014

Report Due – January 30, 2015

Quarter End – March 30, 2015

Report Due – April 30, 2015

Quarter End – June 30, 2015

Report Due – July 30, 2015

Quarter End – September 30, 2015

Report Due – October 30, 2015

Milwaukee Workforce Investment Board CareerWorks

Why do all this?!?!

MAWIB recognized the need to marry two reporting tools – **PRS AND ETO** – to track the effectiveness of two **HPOG** components—employer engagement and job development for one primary reason. . .

Our need to improve **Accountability** and **Transparency** in order to measure success and prioritize future funding based on

Milwaukee Workforce Investment Board CareerWorks

EFFORTS-TO-OUTCOMES (ETO)

- Contains customized attributes about our employers and their **business operations**.
- Enables us to track efforts expended by our job developers to **manage employer outreach** and the associated relationships that are developed
- Identifies **hiring practices** of employers
- Identifies employer **participation** in sponsored events like job fairs and career events

EFFORTS-TO-OUTCOMES (ETO) cont.

- Web-based structure that allows for us to customize reports as needed to **respond** to questions asked by our stakeholders
- Informational reports can be presented in formats not readily assessable in PRS.
- ETO reports **do not duplicate** PRS reports, instead validate the PRS reported outcomes.
- Utilized to support monitoring **activities—saving time and resources.**

Work with Employers or Service Providers

Add New Employer or Service Provider

Update Employer or Service Provider Information

· Record Employer or Service Provider Activities

Add Participant Employment Record

Update or Terminate Participant Employment Record

Custom Reports for CareerWorks - Healthcare

Participant-Related Reports

- Healthcare Enrollment and Dismissal Report
- AHEC CHW Hybrid Outcomes
- Healthcare Resource Room Activities
- AHEC Employer Outreach
- Healthcare Attended Coach Session
- AHEC New Hires
- Healthcare Referral Source
- AHEC Supportive Services
- Healthcare Supportive Services
- Healthcare Training Institute Monthly Review
- Aurora Monthly Review
- HPOG Coach Load Across All Training Programs
- Southeast Monthly Review
- Track Credentials Earned
- Wheaton Monthly Review
- WOW Monthly Review
- Southeast Active Participants with TABE Scores
- HTI Enrollments for Training Programs

Query Reports

- AHEC CHW Hybrid Placements
- All Placements PY 2012
- All Placements PY 2013
- All Placements PY 2014
- Attendance Outcomes
- CIB Remediation
- CNA Transportation
- Credentials CNA
- Enrollment & Dismissal Report with dismissal reason
- Follow-up: Contact Attempts Report
- Follow-up: Program Status Report
- Follow-up: Workforce Development Employment Report
- Healthcare Case Notes
- SIF - Employer Engagement Report
- SIF -Track CIB Performed
- SIF Demog
- Track Educational Details
- Track Training Details

Track AHEC Employer Outreach

Employer Name	Date of Contact	Outcome	Notes	Staff Adding/Updating	Date Added/Updated
Aurora Health Care Inc - Montan	1/16/14	Outreach Activities Planned, Coordinated	Went to aurora Sinai made connection with Beth Bursten Recruiter for front office positions made an appointment to meet on	Sharifian, Jamie	5/21/14
Aurora Health Care Inc - Montan	1/28/14	Outreach Activities Planned, Coordinated	Went to meet Beth Bursten gave her HPOG information and she gave me a list of positions they had available and told me	Sharifian, Jamie	5/21/14
Aurora Health Care Inc - Montan	1/30/14	Participated in Employer Activities/Recruit	3 Clients reached out to insure they filled paper work for the event on this date. They were all set up for interviews	Sharifian, Jamie	5/21/14
Aurora Health Care Inc - Montan	1/13/14	Outreach Activities Planned, Coordinated	Went on website and called all offices to reach out to hr called hr and they told me to get the leads off of the online so I sent out job called to set up a meeting with Rheanne HR rep to discuss HPOG and working together	Sharifian, Jamie	5/21/14
Automated Health	1/9/14	Outreach Activities Planned, Coordinated	was given the run around and eventually left Called and spoke with manager Chris who wanted to work with us to get Pharmacy	Sharifian, Jamie	5/21/14
CVS Pharmacy	1/12/14	New Employer Partnerships	Techs hired but there were no unemployed Called and got no response so I went to the office and got James Griffin's contact information who wanted me to forward	Sharifian, Jamie	5/21/14
Grifols Plasma Care	1/9/14	New Employer Partnerships	Sent job Leads to 70 unemployed CNA graduates Employer hiring CNAs part and full time	Sharifian, Jamie	5/21/14
Cameo Care Center	1/13/14	Other Activities	Went to Veteran Job fair at Goodwill. Spoke with many HR and Management staff to try to establish a route from the MAs that complete	Sharifian, Jamie	5/22/14
Goodwill Mission Support Cente	1/16/14	New Employer Partnerships	Employer onsite 4 participants interviewed two participant hired 	Sharifian, Jamie	5/22/14
Stowell Associates - Care Mana	3/19/14	Participated in Employer Activities/Recruit	Spoke with VA reps as to how we may be able to work to get our clients hired. representatives shared process so we can	Sharifian, Jamie	5/22/14
VA Medical Center	3/26/14	Outreach Activities Planned, Coordinated	reached out to employer during veterans job fair. VA did not feel there was any way at the time that we could work together but there	Sharifian, Jamie	5/22/14
VA Medical Center	1/23/14	Participated in Employer Activities/Recruit	Sent out faxes with authorization form for four clients to get hire or employment verification for prs entry. Clients hired in 4th year second	Sharifian, Jamie	5/23/14
Milwaukee Center for Independ	3/30/14	Outreach Activities Planned, Coordinated	Met with Jill on Jan 23rd at an onsite where we planned to meet to discuss program and set up onsites	Sharifian, Jamie	5/23/14
Stowell Associates - Care Mana	1/23/14	Participated in Employer Activities/Recruit	a)Purpose of Contact: Spoke with Olessia Semenets (General Manager) during State Fair Park's Job Fair event about connecting	Crayton, Kenneth	5/23/14
Med Group Home Healthcare	5/22/14	New Employer Partnerships	Spoke with Wendy, who was only looking for individuals with 2 or three years experience. I told her we would forward individuals that had	Sharifian, Jamie	5/23/14
Nurses NOW	1/8/14	Outreach Activities Planned, Coordinated	Called employer Hr Rep Jennifer said I could call to possibly get names pulled of	Sharifian, Jamie	5/23/14
Talecris Plasma Resources	1/13/14	Outreach Activities Planned, Coordinated	candidates who apply online but they have a	Sharifian, Jamie	5/23/14

a) Purpose of Contact: To engage and connect with recruiters in attendance of the job fair held at State Fair Park, for the purpose of bring them onboard with hiring efforts of HPOG participants.
b) Expected Outcomes: General introduction established/new POC (Point of Contact)-Kelly Drout(HR). Future partnership potential after relationship is further built.

AHEC Staff provided a recruitment event for CNA's on 8.6.14 from 5-7 during Wednesday Late Night Retention Event.

Kelly came out to participate in our 2014 summer career fair for 4 hours and met with 31 participants

Track AHEC New Hires									
Employer Name	Date of Contact	Entry Level New Hires	Mid-Level New Hires	High Level New Hires	Other Healthcare Workers	Other Non-Healthcare Occupations	Notes	Staff Adding/Updating	Date Added/Updated
Alexian Village	9/26/2014	1	0	0	0	0	Ms Nieksha Harris was is working as a CNA \$10.00 hr	Sharifian, Jamie	9/26/2014
Always Best Care Senior Services	7/28/2014	1	0	0	0	0	Christiana Attere DOH 6.12.14 \$10.85/hr C.N.A	Alexander, April	7/28/2014
Always Best Care Senior Services	8/21/2014	1	0	0	0	0	Dorthy Phifer was hired as a cna making 10.00 hr	Sharifian, Jamie	8/21/2014
Anew Healthcare Service	2/11/2014	1	0	0	1	0	Melanie Wallart was hired on making 10.25 hr CNA based off of job posting lead sent out in January	Sharifian, Jamie	5/29/2014
Anew Home Health	8/4/2014	1	0	0	0	0	Sharmilla Morris was hired CNA 10.25 thanks to AHEC job leads and class efforts	Sharifian, Jamie	8/4/2014
attenta Care	9/26/2014	2	0	0	0	0	Markesha Smiley and Tameika Cole are hired as CNAs making 8.50hr.	Sharifian, Jamie	9/26/2014
Aurora Health Care Inc.	1/30/2014	3	0	0	0	0	The CNA event on Jan 30th got 3 CNAs hired Elizabeth Lopez start 2/24 Rita Thoummavong 2/17 Daria Morse-Pankeu 3/3	Sharifian, Jamie	5/21/2014
Aurora Health Care Inc.	4/15/2014	1	0	0	0	0	New Hire: Dorothea Parr CNA employment	Blakley, Jazmine	9/2/2014
Aurora Health Care Inc.	5/12/2014	1	0	0	0	0	Dorothea Parr CNA 11.10 5/12/14	Sharifian, Jamie	8/7/2014
Aurora Health Care Inc.	6/23/2014	8	3	2	0	0	Mercedes Adams CNA 11.30hr 6/23 Jaimee Drankiewics CNA 11.30hr 6/23 Kara Dudzik CNA 11.30 4/10 Tacarri Morehead CNA 11.30 7/7 Marquita Pennick CNA 11.10 4/14 Ann Richardson CNA 11.30 7/14 Tonya Thomas CNA 11.50 6/23 Amber Wuerzberger CNA 11.10 1/27 Jessica Dynes RN 24.60 6/14 Jocelyn Osborne HUC 13.00 5/19 Pamela Jaeschke MA 13.05 4/7 Miranda Lievrouw RN 24.60 5/12 Monica Ivory HUC 12.84 1/27 	Sharifian, Jamie	7/28/2014

HPOG CAREERWORKS PLACEMENTS

Year 4 – October 1, 2013 – September 30, 2014

ETO Report Run Date 11-4-2014

Participant Name	Employer	Job Title	Hourly Wage	Start Date
	Abundant Life Ministry, Inc.	CNA	\$9.25	12/30/2013
	Advanced Pain Management	Medical Assistant II	\$13.75	01/27/2014
	Always Best Care Senior Services	Caregiver	??	06/12/2014
	Anew Home Health	CNA	\$10.25	07/11/2014
	Anew Home Health	CNA	\$10.25	02/11/2014
	Anita's Gardens	CNA	\$11.00	02/04/2014
	Ariel Post Acute Care	Registered Nurse	\$26.00	03/06/2014
	Assisted Living Concepts LLC	Personal Service Assistant	\$9.39	11/29/2013
	Assure Home Care Services	Personal Care Worker	\$8.50	11/01/2013
	Attenta Care Residential Living Options	Careworker	\$8.00	03/07/2014
	Aurora Health Care - Forest Home	CNA	\$11.30	07/29/2014
	Aurora Health Care - Forest Home	CNA	\$11.30	06/23/2014
	Aurora Health Care - Forest Home	CNA	\$12.42	08/04/2014
	Aurora Health Care - Forest Home	CNA	\$11.30	07/14/2014
	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	CNA	\$11.30	06/23/2014

Participant Name	Employer	Job Title	Hourly Wage	Start Date
------------------	----------	-----------	-------------	------------

P. S.	Froedtert Health	HUC	\$13.80	04/21/2014
E. A.	Froedtert Hospital	CNA	\$10.63	06/16/2014
E. D.	Froedtert Hospital	CNA	\$10.96	03/24/2014
L. K.	Froedtert Hospital	CNA	\$12.50	12/30/2013
M. S.	Froedtert Hospital	Graduate Nurse	\$24.00	06/16/2014
B. Z.	Froedtert Hospital	Patient Care Assistant	\$10.96	11/18/2013
K. L.	Froedtert Hospital	Patient Care Assistant	\$11.90	12/16/2013
B. T.	Froedtert Hospital	Respiratory Therapy Assistant	\$18.76	07/14/2014
C. P.	Froedtert Hospital	Reporting Analyst	\$27.50	07/01/2014
S. A.	Froedtert Hospital	RN	\$25.00	04/28/2014

	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	CNA	\$11.10	11/04/2013
	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	CNA	\$11.10	12/20/2013
	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	CNA	\$11.30	06/10/2014
	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	CNA	\$11.10	12/20/2013
	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	CNA	\$10.61	12/30/2013
	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	CNA	\$11.10	04/10/2014
	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	CNA	\$11.10	01/13/2014
	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	CNA	\$11.10	02/24/2014
	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	CNA	\$11.30	07/07/2014
	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	CNA	\$11.10	04/14/2014
	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	CNA	\$11.11	01/20/2014
	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	CNA	\$11.30	07/28/2014
	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	CNA	\$11.30	08/11/2014
	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	CNA	\$11.50	06/23/2014
	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	CNA	\$11.10	02/17/2014
	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	CNA	\$11.10	11/19/2013

	Aurora Health Care Inc. - Montana St	CNA	\$11.10	12/23/2013
	Aurora Health Care Inc. - Montana St	CNA/HUC	\$13.00	05/19/2014
	Aurora Health Care Inc. - Montana St	Medical Assistant	\$13.05	04/07/2014
	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	Nursing Assistant	\$11.10	01/20/2014
	Aurora Health Care Inc. - Montana St	Nursing Assistant	\$11.49	10/28/2013
	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	Registered Nurse	\$25.00	08/04/2014
	Aurora Health Care Inc - Montana St	RN - Cardiac Pulmonary	\$25.00	07/01/2014
	Aurora Medical Center Grafton	Health Unit Clerk	\$12.84	01/27/2014
	Aurora Sheboygan Clinic	Medical Assistant	\$13.05	09/15/2014
	Aurora St. Lukes Medical Center	CNA	\$11.10	11/04/2013
	Aurora St. Lukes Medical Center	CNA	\$11.38	10/28/2013
	Aurora St. Lukes Medical Center	CNA	\$11.10	11/11/2013
	Aurora St. Lukes Medical Center	CNA	\$11.10	03/03/2014
	Aurora St. Lukes Medical Center	CNA	\$11.10	05/12/2014
	Aurora St. Lukes Medical Center	CNA	\$11.10	11/04/2013
	Aurora St. Lukes Medical Center	Nursing Assistant	\$11.10	01/27/2014

	Aurora St. Luke's South Shore	Graduate Nurse	\$24.60	12/30/2013
	Autumn Bay Pewaukee	Caregiver	\$11.00	11/18/2013
	Avalon Square	CNA	\$12.07	01/28/2014
	Brighterside Homecare	CNA	\$11.00	12/02/2013
	Brighter Star	CNA	\$9.00	11/11/2013
	Brookfield Rehabilitation	CNA	\$9.20	01/21/2014
	Cameo Care Center	CNA	\$9.00	05/07/2014
	Capri Communities, LLC	Caregiver	\$10.50	05/23/2014
	Care Age of Brookfield	CNA	\$10.00	02/03/2014
	Care Plus Management	CNA	\$9.00	05/21/2014
	Care Plus Management	CNA	\$9.00	05/22/2014
	Care Plus Management	CNA	\$9.00	05/15/2014
	Caring Senior Services Milwaukee	CNA	\$9.25	03/31/2014
	Cedar Community	CNA	\$11.00	12/09/2013
	Cedar Community	CNA	\$11.00	10/21/2013
	Center for Veterans Issues	Outreach	\$16.34	10/01/2013

Milwaukee Workforce Investment Board CareerWorks

The information requested and provided in the ETO reports has proven to be **relevant** and **purposeful**—as a **collaborative project**, it has helped us track the effectiveness of our employment outreach activities, enhanced our results by acquiring new employer partners who hired our program participants and **expanded current employer relations resulting in increased employment opportunities program**



**To download samples of MAWIB ETO
Reports, go to:**

http://hpogcommunity.acf.hhs.gov/my/_layouts/ng/SocialGroup.aspx?id=4bb1f207-bebf-45b6-b04a-db13d1bb9e07



Schenectady County Community College HPOG

Framing the PRS as a Tool for Cost Benefit Analysis

**Tiziana Rota, Project Director &
Nathan Sick, Urban Institute**

Schenectady County Community College HPOG

Why an Economic Impact Study?

- Media and public relations;
- Employer engagement
- Elected representatives
- Community education
- Stakeholder support
- All part of the sustainability strategies

Schenectady County Community College HPOG

We asked for:

Economic impact

- *Quantify the HPOG program's value to the regional economy*
- *Gain by participants*
- *Reduction in Public Assistance costs*

Schenectady County Community College HPOG

and

Investment analysis

- *Student Return on Investment (ROI)*
- *Taxpayer ROI*
- *Average annual rate of return on investment for Taxpayers*



DATA FLOW

Schenectady County Community College HPOG

PRS to the Rescue...

- ♣ Demographic data from PRS “Reports”;
 - *Participants characteristics – PRS003*
 - *Gender*
 - *Race and ethnicity*
 - *Age*

Schenectady County Community College HPOG

♣ Training data

- *PRS Program Outcomes – PRS011*
- *Number of unduplicated students who completed the training*
- *Number of training tracks*
- *Number of weeks of training*

Schenectady County Community College HPOG

Limitations with specific data

- *Number of unduplicated students who started training by track and demographic data*
- *Number of unduplicated students who completed training by track and demographic data*
- *Use the query tool to obtain the information, but it could not be unduplicated*

First Name	Last Name	Training Program Began - SOC	Training Program Completed - SOC	Any Public Benefit Received	Employed in HC After Intake	Employed in Completed Training SOC after	Employment Development Job SOC	Exit Employment SOC
A	G	31-1015	31-1015	No	Yes	No		31-1014
A	G	31-1011	31-1011	No	Yes	No		31-1014
A	G	31-1014	31-1014	No	Yes	Yes		31-1014
A	G	31-1015	31-1015	No	Yes	No		31-1014
A	G	31-1011	31-1011	No	Yes	No		31-1014
A	G	31-1014	31-1014	No	Yes	Yes		31-1014
A	G	31-1015	31-1015	No	Yes	No	31-1014	31-1014
A	G	31-1011	31-1011	No	Yes	No	31-1014	31-1014
A	G	31-1014	31-1014	No	Yes	Yes	31-1014	31-1014
K	C	31-1014	31-1014	Yes	Yes	Yes		31-1014
K	C	31-1011	31-1011	Yes	Yes	No		31-1014
K	C	31-1015	31-1015	Yes	Yes	No		31-1014
K	C	31-1014	31-1014	Yes	Yes	Yes		31-1014
K	C	31-1011	31-1011	Yes	Yes	No		31-1014
K	C	31-1015	31-1015	Yes	Yes	No		31-1014
K	C	31-1014	31-1014	Yes	Yes	Yes	31-1014	31-1014
K	C	31-1011	31-1011	Yes	Yes	No	31-1014	31-1014
K	C	31-1015	31-1015	Yes	Yes	No	31-1014	31-1014
R	H	31-1015	31-1015	Yes	Yes	No		31-1011
R	H	31-1014	31-1014	Yes	Yes	No		31-1011
R	H	31-1011	31-1011	Yes	Yes	Yes		31-1011
R	H	31-1015	31-1015	Yes	Yes	No		31-1011
R	H	31-1014	31-1014	Yes	Yes	No		31-1011
R	H	31-1011	31-1011	Yes	Yes	Yes		31-1011
R	H	31-1015	31-1015	Yes	Yes	No	31-1011	31-1011
R	H	31-1014	31-1014	Yes	Yes	No	31-1011	31-1011



Schenectady County Community College HPOG

RESULTS

♣ Economic Impact

- *In 2014, HPOG at SCCC will generate an estimated \$ 8.8M of added income to the regional economy*
 - *\$3.54M due to program operations*
 - *\$5.26M due to accumulated contributions of former students currently employed*

Schenectady County Community College HPOG

RESULTS

♣ Student Return on Investment

- *\$46.70 in higher future income for every \$1 of opportunity cost per student*

Schenectady County Community College HPOG

RESULTS

♣ Taxpayer Return on Investment

- A three year investment of \$7.67 M resulted in \$55.38 M in taxpayer benefits from:
 - added tax revenue from student earnings,
 - savings from reduction in government funded services
- For every **\$1** in costs there is a return of **\$7.20** in benefits
- An average annual ROI of **18.7%**





Maximizing the PRS Tool for Cost Benefit Analysis

Useful Reporting Tools & Queries for Stakeholder
Engagement

Nathan Sick, Urban Institute

Schenectady County Community College HPOG

Using PRS as a cost-benefit analysis tool

- The PRS contains a wealth of participant data
- Data is collected at the beginning, middle, end and post-completion
- A variety of interactive tools allow for visualizing this data in order to learn about participant outcomes and gauge program impact

Schenectady County Community College HPOG

What are some of the key PRS components for cost-benefit analysis?

– **Participant characteristics**

- demographics
- employment and education status at intake
- public assistance status (TANF? SNAP? etc.)

– **Outputs**

- healthcare training enrollment
- remedial activities
- support services

– **Outcomes**

- employment – during HPOG, at exit, and at follow-up
- wage (if employed) and sector of employment (HC?)
- program or training completion?

Schenectady County Community College HPOG

PRS Tools for cost-benefit analysis: **the PPR**

29-2099 Health Technologists and Technicians, All Other	Active	<input type="text"/>	0
31-1010 Nursing, Psychiatric and Home Health Aides	Active	<input type="text" value="7"/>	<u>17</u>
31-1011 Home Health Aides	Active	<input type="text" value="90"/>	<u>107</u>
31-1012 Nursing Aides, Orderlies, and Attendants	Active	<input type="text"/>	0
31-1014 Nursing Assistants	Active	<input type="text" value="356"/>	<u>491</u>
31-1015 Orderlies	Active	<input type="text" value="50"/>	<u>130</u>
31-1016 Patient Care Technician	Active	<input type="text" value="2"/>	<u>3</u>

Schenectady County Community College HPOG

Cost-benefit pros and cons: the PPR

– **Pros:**

- **Outputs** and **outcomes** are clearly defined, with each metric laid out for comparison.
- Broken into clear 6-month or 1-year periods of analysis.
- Each metric can be listed by individual participant name, and those lists can be copied into Excel for further analysis

– **Limitations:**

- Analysis time frame is static.
- Cannot be combined with “participant characteristics” (*TANF only*, for example)

Schenectady County Community College HPOG

PRS Tools for cost-benefit analysis: the Query Tool

**Crosstab Table for
Began Training in SOC: 31-1014 Nursing Assistants (Rows) by
Completed Training in SOC: 31-1014 Nursing Assistants (Columns)**

		31-1014 Nursing Assistants			
		Yes	No	Missing	Totals
31-1014 Nursing Assistants	Yes	996	99	0	1,095
	No	0	259	0	259
	Missing	0	0	1,105	1,105
Total		996	358	1,105	2,459

Schenectady County Community College HPOG

Cost-benefit pros and cons: the Query Tool

– Pros:

- **Highly customizable.** Run reports involving almost any variable in the PRS, and many custom variables (“ever employed” or “completed any training”, for example)
- **Variable time frame.** Select your enrollment time frame
- **Filters.** Easily filter your participant group – ex. TANF only
- **Data extracts.** Produce your report in total numbers (ex. number ever employed) or by **List** (same report but ***by name and ID***), and export either type to Excel for further analysis

– Limitations:

- Initial effort to learn your way around it
- No employment by SOC code sector

Schenectady County Community College HPOG

PRS Tools for cost-benefit analysis: Management Reports

HPOG Time Period: 09/30/2010-11/09/2014
Health Profession Opportunity Grants Report Date: 11/09/2014

	09/30/2010-11/09/2014	
	Number	Percent
Indicator		
1) Number of clients enrolled	3830	100.00
2) Unduplicated number of clients enrolled into Healthcare Occupational / Vocational training activity	3298	86.11
3) Unduplicated number of clients who completed a Healthcare Occupational / Vocational training activity	2227	58.15
4) Unduplicated number of clients who became employed in any sector since intake ²	1495	39.03
4a) Unduplicated number of clients who became employed in Healthcare sector or occupation since intake ²	1181	30.84
5) Average wage for those who became employed in Healthcare sector or occupation since intake	13.67	-

Employment and Wage Transitions (Individuals included in indicators 6-8a are also included in indicators 1-5)

6) Unduplicated number of clients who transitioned from unemployment at intake into Healthcare sector or occupation ³	704	18.38
7) Unduplicated number of clients who transitioned from non-Healthcare employment at intake into Healthcare sector or occupation ⁴	228	5.95
8) Unduplicated number of clients employed in Healthcare sector or occupation at intake who experienced a subsequent wage increase in healthcare sector or occupation ⁵	141	3.68
8a) Average wage increase for this group ⁵	3.93	-

Schenectady County Community College HPOG

Cost-benefit pros and cons: Management Reports

– Pros:

- **Many options.** There are 13 management reports, each with different data items included.
- **All categories.** There are data reports with participant characteristics, outputs and outcomes.
- **Customizable.** Most reports have adjustable date ranges.

– Limitations:

- Some reports have participant characteristics, and some have outputs/outcomes, but none have both.
- Some reports cannot be outputted in a “List” format.

Schenectady County Community College HPOG

Customized reports:

	Participants who had either TANF or General Assistance (or both) at the time of intake*				
	Total enrolled receiving TANF or GA: 453				
Career Track	Enrolled in SOC	Employed in SOC	Employed in SOC and completed training in SOC	Employed in SOC and enrolled but did not complete training in SOC	Employed in SOC and did not train in SOC
Nursing Assistants - 31-1014	212	110	105	0	5
Personal Care Assistant - 31-1015	218	25	22	0	3
Home Health Aide - 31-1011	106	27	19	0	8
Registered Nurse - 29-1140**	1	0	0	0	0
Dental Lab Tech - 51-9081	7	1	1	0	0

Schenectady County Community College HPOG

Why cost-benefit analysis?

- Shape current or future programs by understanding what activities lead to the most participant success.
- Learn about what leads to the success for subsets of your participants.
- Provide convincing and high quality data about program success to partners or local employers, in order to increase program visibility and foster sustainability.
- Combine PRS data analysis with cost information in order to determine what aspects of the program have the best value, or result in the most significant economic benefits.

Measurement Matters: Taking (Data) Matters Into Your Own Hands

A few points in summary

- Begin with a compelling question vs. “data diving;”
- Leverage relationships with stakeholders to inform information sharing (what do *they* want/need to know?); and
- Invest the time/energy to learn not only your data but your data system(s).



Facilitated Discussion

Wrap-Up and Q&A

Nicole Bossard

ICF International